

challenged or ignored, as he saw happening in Paris. Lossky's extreme loyalty to the jurisdiction of Moscow eventually alienated him not only from the majority of the Parisian Russian Orthodox community, but later from Fr Eugraph Kovalevsky, one of the original founders of the Brotherhood of Photius, who also eventually broke with Moscow in 1953.³⁴ It was precisely the politically autonomous posture on the part of the Brotherhood of St Sophia and its attempts to support the local metropolitan in Paris that created a background for the doctrinal controversy between Vladimir Lossky and Bulgakov. Here, clothed beneath a debate over questions of the unknowability of the Godhead and the legitimacy of sophiology, they held opposing views of the current relationship between church and state. In addition to their personal convictions, Bulgakov and Lossky were located on opposing sides of a debate on ecclesial politics and both seemed to enjoy the support of their respective brotherhoods.

Today the Orthodox Church in Russia is working on an assessment of its native traditions, while continuing the encounter with the west begun *de rigueur* in the pre-Soviet days when Russians who emigrated to western Europe and other parts of the world retained their native religious identity while accepting many aspects of the foreign culture. New centres of training and higher education have opened, which will further the efforts of Orthodox scholars and lay persons to re-ignite some of the religious flame that had burned until the Council of 1917-18.

Recently, Aleksandr Men', martyred in 1990, has been honoured as one of the key leaders of renewal of Russian Orthodoxy in the glasnost period, and, although he claims no theological dependence on Bulgakov,³⁵ there exists a connection between the two. While lying on his deathbed in 1944, Bulgakov instructed iconographer Sister Joanna Reitlinger to return to her motherland, take up her cross, and carry it with joy.³⁶ She eventually returned to Tashkent in 1955, and later came into close contact with Fr Aleksandr Men'. She considers herself to have been sent to Fr Aleksander by Bulgakov, linking the spiritual mentor of the early part of her adult life to the man who became her mentor and confessor in the latter part of her life. Her depiction of the Divine Sophia in an icon has become one of the famous symbols of the reconnection of the Paris community and the Church in Russia today.

Although many western scholars still read Lossky's *Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church* and consider it to have widely accepted authority in the Orthodox Church, there is scarcely any recognition of the

context in which he wrote it. Lossky became a French citizen in 1939, and claimed ultimately to be an "occidentaliste."³⁷ Ironically he claims that his westernism is also a Russian characteristic, that is, "être plus européen que tous les autres Européens."³⁸ Whether or not Lossky is correct in ascribing such a characteristic to Russians, the new generation of Orthodox believers will surely benefit from a deeper investigation into the lives of both Bulgakov and Lossky. If it is characteristically Russian to revolt against the prior generation, as Turgenev describes in his novel, *Fathers and Sons*, and in so doing to attempt to strip the new age of its "Russianness," then perhaps Lossky rightly calls himself one who is truly Russian in this rather ironic sense. The new generation may be likewise content to have revolted against him.

Endnotes

1. Dr. T. Allan Smith, University of St Michael's College, deserves credit for directing me in the following study and providing helpful insight and critique.
2. Kristiane Burchardi, *Die Moskauer "Religiös-Philosophische Vladimir-Solov'ev-Gesellschaft" (1905-1918)* (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 1998), 13.
3. A.V. Zhuravskii, "Bratstva Pravoslavnye," in *Pravoslavnaia Entsiklopediia* (Moscow: Tserkovno-nauchnyi Tsentri, 2003), 6: 209-210.
4. Zhuravskii, "Bratstva Pravoslavnye," 210. In addition to these two leaders there was also the Brotherhood of Alexander Nevsky (1921) begun by P.E. Kovalevsky, and the Paris Brotherhood of Sergius, started by Ieromonakh Savvoi (Struve).
5. After the completion of this paper a dissertation by Bryn Geffert appeared. It provides rich insights into this period of controversy, especially from the perspective of Anglo-Orthodox relations centering around the Brotherhood of St Alban & St Sergius ("Anglican & Orthodox Between the Wars" [Ph. D. diss., Minneapolis: University of Minnesota, 2003]; see also Bryn Geffert, "The Charges of Heresy Against Sergii Bulgakov," *St Vladimir's Theological Quarterly* 49, no. 1-2 [2005]: 47-66; and Alexis Klimoff, "Georges Florovsky and the Sophiological Controversy," *St Vladimir's Theological Quarterly* 49, no. 1-2 [2005]: 67-100).
6. V.V. Zenkovskii, "O Bratstve Sviatoi Sofii v Emigratsii," in *Bratstvo Sviatoi Sofii: Materialy i Dokumenty 1923-1939*, comp., N.A. Struve (Paris: YMCA-Press, 2000), 5.